State of Arizona Senate Forty-sixth Legislature First Regular Session 2003

CHAPTER 255

SENATE BILL 1267

AN ACT

AMENDING SECTIONS 13-703 AND 13-703.01, ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES; AMENDING SECTION 13-703.01, ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES, AS AMENDED BY THIS ACT; REPEALING SECTION 13-4426, ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES; AMENDING TITLE 13, CHAPTER 40, ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES, BY ADDING SECTIONS 13-4426 AND 13-4426.01; RELATING TO CRIMES.

(TEXT OF BILL BEGINS ON NEXT PAGE)

- i -

Be it enacted by the Legislature of the State of Arizona: Section 1. Section 13-703, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended to read:

13-703. <u>Sentence of death or life imprisonment; aggravating and</u> mitigating circumstances; definition

- A. A person guilty IF THE STATE HAS FILED A NOTICE OF INTENT TO SEEK THE DEATH PENALTY AND THE DEFENDANT IS CONVICTED of first degree murder as defined in section 13-1105 shall suffer, THE DEFENDANT SHALL BE SENTENCED TO death or imprisonment in the custody of the state department of corrections for life or natural life as determined and in accordance with the procedures provided in section 13-703.01. A defendant who is sentenced to natural life is not eligible for commutation, parole, work furlough, work release or release from confinement on any basis. If the defendant is sentenced to life, the defendant shall not be released on any basis until the completion of the service of twenty-five calendar years if the murdered person was fifteen or more years of age and thirty-five years if the murdered person was under fifteen years of age.
- B. At the aggravation phase of the sentencing proceeding that is held pursuant to section 13-703.01, the admissibility of information relevant to any of the aggravating circumstances set forth in subsection F of this section shall be governed by the rules of evidence applicable to criminal trials. The burden of establishing the existence of any of the aggravating circumstances set forth in subsection F of this section is on the prosecution. The prosecution must prove the existence of the aggravating circumstances beyond a reasonable doubt.
- C. At the penalty phase of the sentencing proceeding that is held pursuant to section 13-703.01, the prosecution or the defendant may present any information that is relevant to any of the mitigating circumstances included in subsection G of this section, regardless of its admissibility under the rules governing admission of evidence at criminal trials. The burden of establishing the existence of the mitigating circumstances included in subsection G of this section is on the defendant. The defendant must prove the existence of the mitigating circumstances by a preponderance of the evidence. If the trier of fact is a jury, the jurors do not have to agree unanimously that a mitigating circumstance has been proven to exist. Each juror may consider any mitigating circumstance found by that juror in determining the appropriate penalty.
- D. Evidence that is admitted at the trial and that relates to any aggravating or mitigating circumstances shall be deemed admitted as evidence at a sentencing proceeding if the trier of fact considering that evidence is the same trier of fact that determined the defendant's guilt. The prosecution and the defendant shall be permitted to rebut any information received at the aggravation or penalty phase of the sentencing proceeding and shall be given fair opportunity to present argument as to whether the

· 1 ·

5

information is sufficient to establish the existence of any of the circumstances included in subsections F and G of this section.

- E. In determining whether to impose a sentence of death or life imprisonment, the trier of fact shall take into account the aggravating and mitigating circumstances that have been proven. The trier of fact shall impose a sentence of death if the trier of fact finds one or more of the aggravating circumstances enumerated in subsection F of this section and then determines that there are no mitigating circumstances sufficiently substantial to call for leniency.
- F. The trier of fact shall consider the following aggravating circumstances IN DETERMINING WHETHER TO IMPOSE A SENTENCE OF DEATH:
- 1. The defendant has been convicted of another offense in the United States for which under Arizona law a sentence of life imprisonment or death was imposable.
- 2. The defendant HAS BEEN OR was previously convicted of a serious offense, whether preparatory or completed. CONVICTIONS FOR SERIOUS OFFENSES COMMITTED ON THE SAME OCCASION AS THE HOMICIDE, OR NOT COMMITTED ON THE SAME OCCASION BUT CONSOLIDATED FOR TRIAL WITH THE HOMICIDE, SHALL BE TREATED AS A SERIOUS OFFENSE UNDER THIS PARAGRAPH.
- 3. In the commission of the offense the defendant knowingly created a grave risk of death to another person or persons in addition to the person murdered during the commission of the offense.
- 4. The defendant procured the commission of the offense by payment, or promise of payment, of anything of pecuniary value.
- 5. The defendant committed the offense as consideration for the receipt, or in expectation of the receipt, of anything of pecuniary value.
- 6. The defendant committed the offense in an especially heinous, cruel or deprayed manner.
 - 7. The defendant committed the offense while:
- (a) In the custody of or on authorized or unauthorized release from the state department of corrections, a law enforcement agency or a county or city jail.
 - (b) ON PROBATION FOR A FELONY OFFENSE.
- 8. The defendant has been convicted of one or more other homicides, as defined in section 13-1101, that were committed during the commission of the offense.
- 9. The defendant was an adult at the time the offense was committed or was tried as an adult and the murdered person was under fifteen years of age or was seventy years of age or older.
- 10. The murdered person was an on duty peace officer who was killed in the course of performing the officer's official duties and the defendant knew, or should have known, that the murdered person was a peace officer.
- G. The trier of fact shall consider as mitigating circumstances any factors proffered by the defendant or the state that are relevant in determining whether to impose a sentence less than death, including any

- 2 -

aspect of the defendant's character, propensities or record and any of the circumstances of the offense, including but not limited to the following:

- 1. The defendant's capacity to appreciate the wrongfulness of his conduct or to conform his conduct to the requirements of law was significantly impaired, but not so impaired as to constitute a defense to prosecution.
- 2. The defendant was under unusual and substantial duress, although not such as to constitute a defense to prosecution.
- 3. The defendant was legally accountable for the conduct of another under the provisions of section 13-303, but his participation was relatively minor, although not so minor as to constitute a defense to prosecution.
- 4. The defendant could not reasonably have foreseen that his conduct in the course of the commission of the offense for which the defendant was convicted would cause, or would create a grave risk of causing, death to another person.
 - 5. The defendant's age.
- H. For the purposes of this section, "serious offense" means any of the following offenses if committed in this state or any offense committed outside this state that if committed in this state would constitute one of the following offenses:
 - 1. First degree murder.
 - 2. Second degree murder.
 - 3. Manslaughter.
- 4. Aggravated assault resulting in serious physical injury or committed by the use, threatened use or exhibition of a deadly weapon or dangerous instrument.
 - 5. Sexual assault.
 - 6. Any dangerous crime against children.
 - 7. Arson of an occupied structure.
 - 8. Robbery.
 - 9. Burglary in the first degree.
 - 10. Kidnapping.
 - 11. Sexual conduct with a minor under fifteen years of age.
- Sec. 2. Section 13-703.01, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended to read:

13-703.01. <u>Sentences of death, life imprisonment or natural life; imposition; sentencing proceedings; definitions</u>

A. If the state has filed a notice of intent to seek the death penalty and the defendant is convicted of first degree murder, the trier of fact at the sentencing proceeding shall determine whether to impose a sentence of death IN ACCORDANCE WITH THE PROCEDURES PROVIDED IN THIS SECTION. If THE TRIER OF FACT DETERMINES THAT A SENTENCE OF DEATH IS NOT APPROPRIATE, OR IF the state has not filed a notice of intent to seek the death penalty, and the

- 3 -

3

4

5

6

7 8

9

10

11 12

13

14

15 16

17 18

19

20

21 22

23

24

25

26 27

28

29 30

31

32

33 34

35

36

37 38

39

40

41 42

43

defendant is convicted of first degree murder, the court shall determine whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life.

- Before trial, the prosecution shall notice one or more of the aggravating circumstances under section 13-703, subsection F.
- If the trier of fact finds the defendant guilty of first degree murder, the trier of fact shall then immediately determine whether one or more alleged aggravating circumstances have been proven. This proceeding is the aggravation phase of the sentencing proceeding.
- If the trier of fact finds that one or more of the alleged aggravating circumstances have been proven, the trier of fact shall then immediately determine whether the death penalty should be imposed. proceeding is the penalty phase of the sentencing proceeding.
- E. At the aggravation phase, the trier of fact shall make a special finding on whether each alleged aggravating circumstance has been proven based on the evidence that was presented at the trial or at the aggravation phase. If the trier of fact is a jury, a unanimous verdict is required to find that the aggravating circumstance has been proven. If the trier of fact unanimously finds that an aggravating circumstance has not been proven, the defendant is entitled to a special finding that the aggravating circumstance has not been proven. If the trier of fact unanimously finds no aggravating circumstances, the court shall then determine whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life on the defendant.
- F. The penalty phase shall be held immediately after the trier of fact finds at the aggravation phase that one or more of the aggravating circumstances under section 13-703, subsection F have been proven. A finding by the trier of fact that any of the remaining aggravating circumstances alleged has not been proven or the inability of the trier of fact to agree on the issue of whether any of the remaining aggravating circumstances alleged has been proven shall not prevent the holding of the penalty phase.
- G. At the penalty phase, the defendant and the state may present any evidence that is relevant to the determination of whether there is mitigation that is sufficiently substantial to call for leniency. In order for the trier of fact to make this determination, the state may present any evidence that demonstrates that the defendant should not be shown leniency.
- H. The trier of fact shall determine unanimously whether death is the appropriate sentence. If the trier of fact is a jury and the jury unanimously determines that the death penalty is not appropriate, the court shall determine whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life.
- If the trier of fact at any prior phase of the trial is the same trier of fact at the subsequent phase, any evidence that was presented at any prior phase of the trial shall be deemed admitted as evidence at any subsequent phase of the trial.
- J. At the aggravation phase, if the trier of fact is a jury, the jury 44 wis unable to reach a verdict on any of the alleged aggravating circumstances and the jury has not found that at least one of the alleged aggravating

- 4 -

5

circumstances has been proven, the court shall dismiss the jury and shall impanel a new jury. The new jury shall not retry the issue of the defendant's guilt or the issue regarding any of the aggravating circumstances that the first jury found not proved by unanimous verdict. If the new jury is unable to reach a unanimous verdict, the court shall impose a sentence of life or natural life on the defendant.

- K. At the penalty phase, if the trier of fact is a jury and the jury is unable to reach a verdict, the court shall dismiss the jury and shall impanel a new jury. The new jury shall not retry the issue of the defendant's guilt or the issue regarding any of the aggravating circumstances that the first jury found by unanimous verdict to be proved or not proved. If the new jury is unable to reach a unanimous verdict, the court shall impose a sentence of life or natural life on the defendant.
- L. If the jury that rendered a verdict of guilty is not the jury first impaneled for the aggravation phase, the jury impaneled in the aggravation phase shall not retry the issue of the defendant's guilt. If the jury impaneled in the aggravation phase is unable to reach a verdict on any of the alleged aggravating circumstances and the jury has not found that at least one of the alleged aggravating circumstances has been proven, the court shall dismiss the jury and shall impanel a new jury. The new jury shall not retry the issue of the defendant's guilt or the issue regarding any of the aggravating circumstances that the first jury found not proved by unanimous verdict. If the new jury is unable to reach a unanimous verdict, the court shall impose a sentence of life or natural life on the defendant.
- M. Alternate jurors who are impaneled for the trial in a case in which the offense is punishable by death shall not be excused from the case until the completion of the sentencing proceeding.
- N. If the sentence of a person who was sentenced to death is overturned, the person shall be resentenced pursuant to this section by a jury that is specifically impaneled for this purpose as if the original sentencing had not occurred.
- O. In any case that requires sentencing or resentencing in which the defendant has been convicted of an offense that is punishable by death and in which the trier of fact was a judge or a jury that has since been discharged, the defendant shall be sentenced or resentenced pursuant to this section by a jury that is specifically impaneled for this purpose.
- P. The trier of fact shall make all factual determinations required by this section or the Constitution of the United States or this state to impose a death sentence.
- Q. IF THE DEATH PENALTY WAS NOT ALLEGED OR WAS ALLEGED BUT NOT IMPOSED, THE COURT SHALL DETERMINE WHETHER TO IMPOSE A SENTENCE OF LIFE OR NATURAL LIFE. IN DETERMINING WHETHER TO IMPOSE A SENTENCE OF LIFE OR NATURAL LIFE, THE COURT:
 - 1. MAY CONSIDER ANY EVIDENCE INTRODUCED BEFORE SENTENCING OR AT ANY OTHER SENTENCING PROCEEDING.

- 5 -

44¹/₂

- 2. SHALL CONSIDER THE AGGRAVATING AND MITIGATING CIRCUMSTANCES LISTED IN SECTION 13-702 AND ANY STATEMENT MADE BY A VICTIM.
- Q. R. Subject to the provisions of section 13-703, subsection B, a victim has the right to be present at the aggravation phase and to present any information that is relevant to the proceeding. A victim has the right to be present and to present information at the penalty phase. At the penalty phase, the victim may present information about the murdered person and the impact of the murder on the victim and other family members and may submit a victim impact statement in any format to the trier of fact.
 - R. S. For the purposes of this section:
- 1. "Trier of fact" means a jury unless the defendant and the state waive a jury, in which case the trier of fact shall be the court.
- 2. "Victim" means the murdered person's spouse, parent, child or other lawful representative, except if the spouse, parent, child or other lawful representative is in custody for an offense or is the accused.
- Sec. 3. Section 13-703.01, Arizona Revised Statutes, as amended by section 2 of this act, is amended to read:

13-703.01. <u>Sentences of death or life imprisonment; imposition;</u> sentencing proceedings; definitions

- A. If the state has filed a notice of intent to seek the death penalty and the defendant is convicted of first degree murder, the trier of fact at the sentencing proceeding shall determine whether to impose a sentence of death in accordance with the procedures provided in this section. If the trier of fact determines that a sentence of death is not appropriate, or if the state has not filed a notice of intent to seek the death penalty, and the defendant is convicted of first degree murder, the court shall determine whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life.
- B. Before trial, the prosecution shall notice one or more of the aggravating circumstances under section 13-703, subsection F.
- C. If the trier of fact finds the defendant guilty of first degree murder, the trier of fact shall then immediately determine whether one or more alleged aggravating circumstances have been proven. This proceeding is the aggravation phase of the sentencing proceeding.
- D. If the trier of fact finds that one or more of the alleged aggravating circumstances have been proven, the trier of fact shall then immediately determine whether the death penalty should be imposed. This proceeding is the penalty phase of the sentencing proceeding.
- E. At the aggravation phase, the trier of fact shall make a special finding on whether each alleged aggravating circumstance has been proven based on the evidence that was presented at the trial or at the aggravation phase. If the trier of fact is a jury, a unanimous verdict is required to find that the aggravating circumstance has been proven. If the trier of fact unanimously finds that an aggravating circumstance has not been proven, the defendant is entitled to a special finding that the aggravating circumstance has not been proven. If the trier of fact unanimously finds no aggravating

- 6 -

42 .1

circumstances, the court shall then determine whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life on the defendant.

- F. The penalty phase shall be held immediately after the trier of fact finds at the aggravation phase that one or more of the aggravating circumstances under section 13-703, subsection F have been proven. A finding by the trier of fact that any of the remaining aggravating circumstances alleged has not been proven or the inability of the trier of fact to agree on the issue of whether any of the remaining aggravating circumstances alleged has been proven shall not prevent the holding of the penalty phase.
- G. At the penalty phase, the defendant and the state may present any evidence that is relevant to the determination of whether there is mitigation that is sufficiently substantial to call for leniency. In order for the trier of fact to make this determination, the state may present any evidence that demonstrates that the defendant should not be shown leniency.
- H. The trier of fact shall determine unanimously whether death is the appropriate sentence. If the trier of fact is a jury and the jury unanimously determines that the death penalty is not appropriate, the court shall determine whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life.
- I. If the trier of fact at any prior phase of the trial is the same trier of fact at the subsequent phase, any evidence that was presented at any prior phase of the trial shall be deemed admitted as evidence at any subsequent phase of the trial.
- J. At the aggravation phase, if the trier of fact is a jury, the jury is unable to reach a verdict on any of the alleged aggravating circumstances and the jury has not found that at least one of the alleged aggravating circumstances has been proven, the court shall dismiss the jury and shall impanel a new jury. The new jury shall not retry the issue of the defendant's guilt or the issue regarding any of the aggravating circumstances that the first jury found not proved by unanimous verdict. If the new jury is unable to reach a unanimous verdict, the court shall impose a sentence of life or natural life on the defendant.
- K. At the penalty phase, if the trier of fact is a jury and the jury is unable to reach a verdict, the court shall dismiss the jury and shall impanel a new jury. The new jury shall not retry the issue of the defendant's guilt or the issue regarding any of the aggravating circumstances that the first jury found by unanimous verdict to be proved or not proved. If the new jury is unable to reach a unanimous verdict, the court shall impose a sentence of life or natural life on the defendant.
- L. If the jury that rendered a verdict of guilty is not the jury first impaneled for the aggravation phase, the jury impaneled in the aggravation phase shall not retry the issue of the defendant's guilt. If the jury impaneled in the aggravation phase is unable to reach a verdict on any of the alleged aggravating circumstances and the jury has not found that at least one of the alleged aggravating circumstances has been proven, the court shall dismiss the jury and shall impanel a new jury. The new jury shall not retry

- 7 -

the issue of the defendant's guilt or the issue regarding any of the aggravating circumstances that the first jury found not proved by unanimous verdict. If the new jury is unable to reach a unanimous verdict, the court shall impose a sentence of life or natural life on the defendant.

- M. Alternate jurors who are impaneled for the trial in a case in which the offense is punishable by death shall not be excused from the case until the completion of the sentencing proceeding.
- N. If the sentence of a person who was sentenced to death is overturned, the person shall be resentenced pursuant to this section by a jury that is specifically impaneled for this purpose as if the original sentencing had not occurred.
- O. In any case that requires sentencing or resentencing in which the defendant has been convicted of an offense that is punishable by death and in which the trier of fact was a judge or a jury that has since been discharged, the defendant shall be sentenced or resentenced pursuant to this section by a jury that is specifically impaneled for this purpose.
- P. The trier of fact shall make all factual determinations required by this section or the Constitution of the United States or this state to impose a death sentence.
- Q. If the death penalty was not alleged or was alleged but not imposed, the court shall determine whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life. In determining whether to impose a sentence of life or natural life, the court:
- 1. May consider any evidence introduced before sentencing or at any other sentencing proceeding.
- 2. Shall consider the aggravating and mitigating circumstances listed in section 13-702 and any statement made by a victim.
- R. Subject to the provisions of section 13-703, subsection B, a victim has the right to be present at the aggravation phase and to present any information that is relevant to the proceeding. A victim has the right to be present and to present information at the penalty phase. At the penalty phase, the victim may present information about the murdered person and the impact of the murder on the victim and other family members and may submit a victim impact statement in any format to the trier of fact HAS THE RIGHT TO BE HEARD PURSUANT TO SECTION 13-4426.
 - S. For the purposes of this section:
- 1. "Trier of fact" means a jury unless the defendant and the state waive a jury, in which case the trier of fact shall be the court.
- 2. "Victim" means the murdered person's spouse, parent, child or other lawful representative, except if the spouse, parent, child or other lawful representative is in custody for an offense or is the accused.

Sec. 4. Repeal

Section 13-4426, Arizona Revised Statutes, is repealed.

- 8 -

5

Sec. 5. Title 13, chapter 40, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended by adding a new section 13-4426, to read:

13-4426. Sentencing

NOTWITHSTANDING ANY OTHER LAW OR RULE, AS AN EXERCISE OF THE VICTIM'S CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHT TO BE HEARD AT SENTENCING, BEFORE THE IMPOSITION OF SENTENCE THE VICTIM IN ANY CASE MAY ADDRESS THE SENTENCING AUTHORITY AND PRESENT ANY INFORMATION OR OPINIONS THAT CONCERN THE VICTIM OR THE VICTIM'S FAMILY, INCLUDING THE IMPACT OF THE CRIME ON THE VICTIM, THE HARM CAUSED BY THE CRIME, THE CRIMINAL OFFENSE, THE DEFENDANT, THE NEED FOR RESTITUTION OR THE SENTENCE TO BE IMPOSED AT EVERY SENTENCING OR DISPOSITION PROCEEDING.

Sec. 6. Title 13, chapter 40, Arizona Revised Statutes, is amended by adding section 13-4426.01, to read:

13-4426.01. Sentencing; victims' right to be heard

IN ANY PROCEEDING IN WHICH THE VICTIM HAS THE RIGHT TO BE HEARD PURSUANT TO ARTICLE II, SECTION 2.1, CONSTITUTION OF ARIZONA, OR THIS CHAPTER, THE VICTIM'S RIGHT TO BE HEARD IS EXERCISED NOT AS A WITNESS, THE VICTIM'S STATEMENT IS NOT SUBJECT TO DISCLOSURE TO THE STATE OR THE DEFENDANT OR SUBMISSION TO THE COURT AND THE VICTIM IS NOT SUBJECT TO CROSS-EXAMINATION. THE STATE AND THE DEFENSE SHALL BE AFFORDED THE OPPORTUNITY TO EXPLAIN, SUPPORT OR DENY THE VICTIM'S STATEMENT.

Sec. 7. Intent

- A. The Legislature reaffirms its action in Laws 2002, fifth special session, chapter 1, in which the Legislature eliminated the statutory prohibition on considering a victim's sentencing recommendation in a capital case. The Legislature reaffirms that, under the Constitution and statutes of Arizona, victims in capital cases have the right to make recommendations regarding the appropriate sentence, in the same manner as defendants, and that the only thing that stands in the way of exercising this right is the lack of a decision by the Arizona supreme court or the supreme court of the United States affirming this right.
- B. The Legislature enacts sections 3, 4 and 5 of this act pursuant to its authority as prescribed by article II, section 2.1, subsection A, paragraph 11 and subsection D, Constitution of Arizona.

Sec. 8. Conditional enactment

- A. The following do not become effective unless on or before June 30, 2013 the Arizona supreme court or the supreme court of the United States rules that it is constitutional for a crime victim in a capital case to make a sentencing recommendation:
- 1. Section 13-703.01, Arizona Revised Statutes, as amended by section $\bf 3$ of this act.
 - 2. Section 4 of this act.
 - 3. Section 13-4426, Arizona Revised Statutes, as added by this act.
- B. The attorney general shall notify in writing the director of the Arizona legislative council of the date on which the condition is met or if the condition is not met.

APPROVED BY THE COVERNOR MAY 26, 2003.

Man 1 22	a . March 12 AZ
Passed the House May 1, 20 03,	Passed the Senate March 2, 20 03,
by the following vote: 56 Ayes,	by the following vote: 29 Ayes,
ONays,4Not Voting	Nays, Not Voting
Speaker, of the House Pro Tempere Moore Chief Clerk of the House	President of the Senate Secretary of the Senate
OFFICE OF	RTMENT OF ARIZONA R GOVERNOR d by the Governor this
	Secretary to the Governor
Approved this day of, 20,	
ato'clockM.	
Governor of Arizona	EXECUTIVE DEPARTMENT OF ARIZONA OFFICE OF SECRETARY OF STATE

S.B. 1267

This Bill	was received by the Se	ecretary of State
this	day of	, 20,
at	o'clock	М.
		Secretary of Stan

HOUSE FINAL PASSAGE as per Joint Conference	SENATE FINAL PASSAGE as per Joint Conference
Passed the House May, 19, 2003,	Passed the Senate May 15 , 20 03
by the following vote: 48 Ayes,	by the following vote: 27 Ayes,
Nays, 5 Not Voting Speaker of the House Horman L. Moore Chief Clerk of the House	Not Voting Not Voting President of the Senate Secretary of the Senate
	ARTMENT OF ARIZONA COF GOVERNOR
at 12:30 Secretary	Geider M.
Approved this	
Governor of Arizona	EXECUTIVE DEPARTMENT OF ARIZONA OFFICE OF SECRETARY OF STATE
S.B. 1267	This Bill was received by the Secretary of State this